Traditional Islamic Religious Practice Arguments: Criticism of The Concept of Bid'ah of Islam Salafi-Wahabi

1Sofyan A.P. Kau, 2Zulkarnain Suleman, 3Irwan
12Institut Agama Islam Negeri Sultan Amali Gorontalo, 3BRIN

Abstract
This paper discusses traditional Islamic criticism of the concept of heresy in Salafi Islam, categorizing every new act in religion as iconoclastic heresy. Based on this concept of heresy, ritual ceremonies and practices of traditional Islamic religious traditions are classified as acts of heresy. Through literature research based on literary document sources using abstractive inductive logic methods and content analysis, this study found that ritual ceremonies and practices of traditional Islamic religious traditions are not acts of heresy because they are based on theorem (al-Quran, hadith and allegiance) it is new. New actions (mutants) are categorized as bid’ah if they conflict with the Quran, hadith, and a tsar. Traditional Islam criticizes the concept of heresy in Salafi-Wahhabi Islam for being ahistorical because several traditions show that the innovation of a friend, tābi’u tābi’uttab’în, while this innovation was not ordered and practiced by the Prophet; instead, was carried out by the generation of the Salaf.

Keywords: criticism, Salafi-Wahhabi Islam, traditional Islam, bid’ah

Argumen Praktik Keagamaan Islam Tradisional: Kritik terhadap Konsep Bid’ah Islam Salafi-Wahabi

Abstrak

Kata kunci: kritik, Islam Salafi-Wahhabi, Islam tradisional, bid’ah

Author correspondence
Email: sofyan.ap.kau@gmail.com
Available online at http://journal.iaingorontalo.ac.id/index.php/au/index
A. Introduction

Traditional Islam is one of the most popular forms of Islamic understanding and practice and is widely embraced by the Indonesian Muslim community.\(^1\) Zamakhshyari Dhofier (b. 1941 AD) formulated traditional Islam as Islam which is still firmly bound by the thoughts of the scholars of jurisprudence (Islamic law), hadith, interpretation, monotheism (Islamic theology), and tasawuf who lived between the 7th and 7th centuries 13\(^{th}\).\(^2\) In accepting hadith, traditionalists – especially NU – tend to be looser because they are more concerned with the substance of hadith (matan) than the chain of hadith (sanad), especially to encourage the virtue and perfection of worship (fadhâilula'mâl).\(^3\) The perfection of worship is enriched with an inner dimension, and because of that traditionalists make Sufism an esoteric dimension of Islam by referring to the Sufism tradition of Imam al-Ghazâlî (d. 505 H) and al-Junaidi al-Baghadâdî (d. 298 H). In line with that, the tarekat tradition is a prominent feature of traditionalist Islamic groups -even though limiting it to the mukhabarat tariqah.\(^4\) While ideologically, they refer to the theological formulation of Imam Abû al-Hasan al-Asy’arî (d. 936 AD). These three

---

1 Traditional Islam is usually contrasted with modernist Islam. Modernist Islam, which Muhammadiyah and Persis represent, is assumed to be a religious organization that is geographically urban-based and ideologically revivalist due to the orientation of its religious understanding towards Salafism. The ideological paradigm of Muhammadiyah is a return to pristine Islam, "pure" Islam as practiced by the Prophet Muhammad and his companions. Because the Prophet and his companions never did the local elements, they were considered religious innovations. It must be returned to the Quran and al-Sunnah to ensure pure Islamic teachings. Deliar Noer (d. 2008) first recognized the discourse on traditional Islam and modern Islam through his work, Deliar Noer, "Gerakan Modern Islam Indonesia 1900-1942," VIII, (Jakarta: LP3ES), 1996. The characteristics and typologies of traditional Islam and modernist Islam are irrelevant today. The typology is only suitable in the 80s. Because both NU and Muhammadiyah have experienced developments, especially in responding to issues of modernity and Islamic thought.


4 In language, tariqah means way, and mukhabarat means that which is recognized; the sanad continues until the Messenger of Allah. Tariqah mukhabarat means the way that is recognized/legalized by NU scholars, there are dozens of them, and it has its procedures of practice. Munawir Abdul Fattah, Tradisi Orang-Orang NU (PT LKiS Pelangi Aksara, 2006), h. 25. The number, amaliah and ins and outs of the mu’tabarah tariqah can be read in A. Aziz Masyhuri, Permasalahan Thariqah: Hasil Kesepakatan Muktamar & Musyawarah Besar Jam’iyyah Ahiith Thariqah al-Mu’tabarah Nahdlatul Ulama, 1957-2005 M. (Diterbitkan bersama [antara] Khalista [dengan] Pesantren Al-Aziziyyah ..., 2006).
aspects (fiqh, theology, and tasawuf) become traditional Islamic identities that are attributed to NU.\(^5\) Popularly, traditionalists identify themselves as ahlussunnah wal jamaah, abbreviated as Aswaja.\(^6\)

In addition to aspects of theology and Sufism, traditionalists are known to appreciate the four schools of thought. Even bermadzhab on the products of the thought of previous scholars. This is because, for traditionalist Muslims, fiqh is the queen of Islamic sciences; instructions for all behavior and explanations of what is permissible and what is not.\(^7\) The results of the formulation of the classical scholars were accepted without criticism, so the door to ijtihad was closed. Instead, they emphasized more on the attitude of taqlid. Interpreting independently and independently is considered dangerous, and it is safer to follow what is standardized by the four schools of Sunni fiqh: Hanafi (d. 150 H), Mālikī (d. 179 H), al-Syāfi‘ī (d. 204 H) and Hanbali (d. 241 H). This attitude gave rise to high respect for the deceased and living scholars because they were the heirs of the Prophets.

Respect for scholars who have died gave birth to a tradition called haul and pilgrimage to the graves of saints. Haul is a tradition of commemorating scholars’ death, which is filled with prayers and tahliil. While visiting the graves is visiting the graves of the scholars, especially those belonging to the saints, besides praying for them they also receive blessings. Because of this, the tradition of tawasul was born, which is a characteristic of the diversity of traditionalists. Tawasul means to ask

\(^5\) Besides NU, other groups categorized as traditionalist Islam are Jama’ah Tabligh, Perti (Association of Tarbiyah Islamiyah), and Al-Washliyah or al-Jam’ah Washliyah. Syamsuar Syam, “TRADISIONALISME ISLAM SUATU KARAKTER DAN POLA PENGBANGAN ISLAM DI INDESIA,” Al-Hikmah: Jurnal Dakwah dan Ilmu Komunikasi, no. 0 (June 1, 2018): h. 24-25, doi:10.15548/al-hikmah.v0i0.90.

\(^6\) According to K. H. Bisyri Mustafa Ahlu Sunnah wal Jama’ah is an ideology that adheres to three traditions: in the field of Islamic law, adheres to one of the four schools of thought (Hanafi, Maliki, Shafi‘i, and Hanbali). In practice, Kyai is strong adherents of the Shafi‘i school of thought; in monotheism, adhering to the teachings of Imam Hasan al-Asy’ariy and Imam Mansur al-Maturidiy; and in the field of Sufism, adhering to the basic teachings of Imam Abu Qasim al-Junaid Bisyri Musthafa, Risalah Ahlu Sunnah Wal Jama’ah (Yayasan Al-Ibriz, 1967), h. 19. Abuddin Nata, Peta Keragaman Pemikiran Islam Di Indonesia, 2016, h. 144.

Allah by making tawasul to the saints when one of them is making a pilgrimage to the saint's grave.\(^8\)

Because of this, the traditions of prayer for salvation, tahlilan, wasilah, and visiting graves are often attached to traditional Islam as a religious characteristic. Traditional Islam is also known for its helpful attitude toward local culture. Celebrating Islamic holidays - such as Mawlid Isra’i’raj, Nuzul Quran, 10 Muharram, and Nisfus Syaban - are several traditions traditionalist Muslims practice. Apart from the tradition of reading Diba’-Barjanzi at the akikah ceremony, reciting the quran (such as Yasin’s letter) to those who have died and rewarding them with reading rewards is common in traditional Islamic religious practices. Of course, at the same time, ceremonies and rites related to the life cycle are tolerated by traditional Islamic groups, such as ngapati, tingkeban, or mitoni and planting the placenta.\(^9\)

The local Islamic traditions above have received sharp criticism from Salafi-Wahhabi Islamic groups.\(^10\) This criticism was very aggressively launched both through print media (books and magazines) and social media (such as YouTobe). The Salafi-Wahhabi Islamic group accuses all traditional Islamic religious practices of heresy, infidel, and shirk. This accusation certainly disturbs the religious comfort of the traditionalists. In some areas, this has resulted in conflicts such as the one that occurred in the Purworejo area, Central Java, in 2011 with followers of the Al-Qur’an

---

\(^8\) Fattah, *Tradisi Orang-Orang NU*, h. 316.

\(^9\) The traditions and ceremonies of ngapati, tingkeban or mitoni and planting the placenta can be read in Muhammad Sholikhin, *Ritus dan tradisi Islam Jawa: ritual-ritual dan tradisi-tradisi tentang kehamilan, kelahiran, pernikahan, dan kematian dalam kehidupan sehari-hari masyarakat Islam Jawa* (Penerbit Narasi, 2010), h. 71-90. Fattah, *Tradisi Orang-Orang NU*, h. 291-293.

\(^10\) Long before the presence of Wahhabi Salafi Islam, the same criticism had been made by Muhammadiyah and Persis as Modernist Islamic groups. The polemic between Muhammadiyah and NU can be read in M. Yusuf Amin Nugroho, *Fiqh Ikhtilaf NU-Muhammadiyah; Sutiyono, Benturan Budaya Islam; Puritanisme Dan Sinkretis* (Jakarta: Kompas, 2010). Zainuddin Fananie and Atiqa Sabardila, “Sumber Konflik Masyarakat Muslim NU-Muhammadiyah Perspektif Kebertaerimaan Tahill, Surakarta” (Muhammadiyah University Press, 2001). Meanwhile, the polemic between traditionalist Islam and modernist Islam can be read in A. Hasan Bandung’s book *Questions and Answers by A. Hasan*, a figure and founder of Persis as a modernist Islamic group. At the same time, the defense of traditional Islam can be read in the works of KH. Sirajuddin Abbas is a Perti figure, such as *40 Religious Issues (4 Volumes)* and ‘Aqidah Ahlussunnah Waljama’ah. Therefore, criticism of Salafi Islam on the Islamic archipelago tradition is not new. The criticism is an "old song" that is played back using social media such as YouTobe.
Interpretation Council (MTA) and in Surabaya in 2015 between the community around the Sido Topo Village and the STAI Ali Bin Abi Talib. The views and religious attitudes of the Salafi-Wahhabi Islamic group, in the perspective of religious moderation, are categorized as intolerant towards the culture and religious traditions of the majority of Indonesian Muslims.

Traditionalist Muslims responded to the criticism of the Salafi-Wahhabi Islamic groups above with religious answers and arguments. In order to formulate answers and arguments for the traditional Islamic religion, a literature study was conducted which contained answers and defenses for traditional Islam against criticisms of Salafi-Wahhabi Islam. Literary data were analyzed using abstractive inductive logic and content-analyzing methods. The abstractive inductive logic method in qualitative research is interpreted as a logic that starts from "specific to general" to distinguish verifiable deductive logic in quantitative research, as opposed to the first mentioned. Meanwhile, the deductive method is used to obtain an overview of the details of Salafi-Wahhabi Islamic thought, criticism of the tradition of religious practice in Indonesia, and the defense and argumentation of Traditional Islam on the legitimacy of the tradition of religious practice in Indonesia. At the same time, the inductive method is intended to obtain a complete picture of the paradigms and topical thoughts of Salafi-Wahhabi Islam and traditional Islam regarding the paradigms, understanding, and reasoning of both the traditions of religious practice in Indonesia. At the same time, the content analysis method is used to analyze traditional Islamic defenses and arguments for traditional religious practices in Indonesia. Content analysis was carried out through the stages of identification, classification, and categorization, as well as interpretation.

11 Indriyani Ma’rifah and Ahmad Asroni, BEREBUT LADANG DAKWAH PADA MASYARAKAT MUSLIM JAWA: (Studi Kasus Terhadap Konflik Majelis Tafsir Al-Qur’an (MTA) Dan Nahdatul Ulama (NU) Di Kabupaten Purworejo (Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, 2013).
12 Kementrian Agama RI, Moderasi Beragama (Jakarta: Badan Litbang dan Diklat kementrian agama RI, 2019).
A. Traditional Islamic Religious Practices and Accusations of Heresy

Salafi-Wahhabi Muslims consider traditional Islamic religious practices to be acts of heresy. This religious practice consists of death, traditions, and worship rituals. Aspects related to death such as escorting the body accompanied by recitation of tahlil,\(^ {14} \) call to prayer and iqamah, as well as talqin on the grave after the body is buried, gathering at the funeral home or the deceased's family for takziyah, holding a prayer of salvation for three days, seven days, forty days, or a year; reciting the quran and preparing food whose rewards are intended to be given to the dead. The deceased does not benefit from reading the Quran because he has died.\(^ {15} \) In contrast, during the time of the Prophet, companions, and salafushshâlih, the doors of the deceased's family's house were closed. They express their condolences when they meet the deceased's family in the market, mosque, or other places. They do not make food because making food and gathering in the house is "wailing," while "wailing" is a grave sin.\(^ {16} \)

All matters related to death above are categorized as heresy because they were never carried out during the time of the Prophet and his companions; unknown at the time of the salafushshâlih; there is no history from the Prophet, his companions, and salafushshâlih for this deed. Had it been good, they would have done it beforehand. Strictly speaking, these actions have no basis in the Shari'a.\(^ {17} \) On the contrary, what is prescribed, when meeting someone whom a disaster has struck is to pray for him and pray for the deceased, such as by saying: "ahsanallâh 'azâka wa jabbarallâhu mushîbâka wa ghaftarallâh mayyitika." Therefore, these actions are not only bid'ah but also classified as unjust acts and are a tradition of ignorance.\(^ {18} \)


\(^ {15} \) Ibid.


\(^ {18} \) Ibid. Bâz, *Majmû’ Fatâwâ Wa Maqâlât Mutawwi’ah, Juz V*. 
Meanwhile, related to aspects of the tradition that Salafi-Wahabi Islam propagates, such as the tradition of the Prophet’s birthday,19 isra’ mi’raj,20 nuzul al-Quran, hijrah new year,21 nishfu sya’ban,22 death celebration (tahlilan),23 seven months of salvation,24 new year celebrations,25 aqiqah celebrations with worship ceremonies such as reading Barjanzi and others,26 housewarming celebrations,27 orphans Eid celebrations,28 celebrations thanks giving,29 congratulations khatam al-Quran,30 and the holiday of diamonds.31

While those related to worship rituals include strengthening the intention in prayer (reading ushullî),32 reading surah al-Fatihah after completing the obligatory

---


26 Abdat, *Risalah Bid’ah*, h. 245;

27 Ibid., h. 245; at-Tuwaijiry, *Ritual Bid’ah Dalam Setahun*, h. 405;

28 Ibid., h. 245; Ibid., h. 402 dan 410;

29 Ibid., h. 245;

30 Ibid., h. 245;

31 Ibid., h. 245;

prayers, reading prayers together after prayer or dhikr aloud led by the priest, praying together after prayer, praying led by the priest after completing the obligatory prayers, wiping the face after finishing the prayer, shaking hands after finishing the prayer or after finishing the prayer standing shaking hands taking turns while reciting salawat, Qunut dawn continuously, Call to prayer twice at the mosque on Fridays, and read prayers together after prayer.

B. Traditional Islamic answers and arguments

The three aspects of traditional Islamic religious practices Salafi-Wahhabi Islam hereof are rejected by traditional Islamic groups. The assessment and rejection begin with an understanding of the concept of bid’ah. Of course, the concept of heresy from a traditional Islamic perspective differs from the concept of Salafi-Wahhabi Islam. Bid’ah means creating something not based on an example; or making innovations that did not exist before. In the terminology of Ahlussunnah waljama’ah scholars, heresy is interpreted as something new that is not explicitly found in the Quran and hadith. According to Ibn ’Arabi – as quoted by Abu Abdillah,

---

35 al-Qaththani, Awas Bahaya Bid’ah Bid’ah Berkedok Sunnah., h. 132; Abdat, Risalah Bid’ah., h. 194; al-Mathar, Ensiklopedi Bid’ah Kumpulan Fatwa Syaikh ‘Abdul’ Aziz Bin Baz, Lajnah Daimah Li al-Buhuts al-Ilmiyyah, Syaikh Muhammad Bin Shalih al-Utsaimin, Syaikh ’Abdullah Ibn ‘Abdurrahman al-Jibrin Dan Syaikh Shalih Bin Fauzan al-Fauzan., h. 358, 368, 407 and 412-413;
36 Abdat, Risalah Bid’ah., h. 194;
37 Ibid., h. 194 and 202; ‘Abdussalam, Bid’ah-Bid’ah Yang Dianggap Sunnah., h. 72;
39 Ibid., h. 209 dan 214;
41 Al-Râghîb al-Ashfahânî, Mu’amal Mufradât Alfâzh al-Qur’ân (Beirút: Dâr al-Fikr, n.d.), h. 36.

8 Al-Ulam ISSN 1412-0534, E ISSN 2442-8213
linguistically, the term heresy and new things are not reprehensible. However, bid’ah is rebuked if it violates the sunnah; new cases are reproached if they lead to misguidance. This means that the terms bid’ah and new cases (muhdats) are neutral terms, which can have positive and negative connotations. Therefore, Imam al-Syâfi’î (d. 204 H) divides into two categories: heretical (dhalâlah) and beyond reproach (ghayr madzmûmah). Bid’ah heresy is a matter that is contrary to the quran, sunnah, atsar and ijmâ’. While heresy is not reprehensible (ghayr madzmûmah) is a matter that does not conflict with the quran, sunnah, atsar and ijmâ’. The same division was put forward by Imam Ibn Atsîr al-Jazarî (d. 606 H).

Cases in accordance with religious instructions contrary to Allah’s orders and the Messenger of Allah are categorized as bid’ah hudâ. At the same time, the case that is contrary to both is disgraceful and rejected bid’ah. While matters under the auspices of the generality of Allah’s commandments and are things that Allah and His Messenger recommend, they are considered commendable bid’ah.

According to Abu Abdillah, the division of bid’ah into the two categories above comes from the hadith "Who makes this new thing in our religion, which is not following it (ما لَيْسَ مِنْهُ), then it is rejected". The editorial "ما لَيْسَ مِنْهُ" (what is not following it) in the hadith above indicates that new cases are contradictory and violate the Shari’a, so they are rejected as for new cases that do not contradict and violate the Shari’a, they are indeed accepted which are technically called bid’ah Hashanah, or the term Imam al-Syâfi’î (d. 204 H), bid’ah mahmûdah (bid’ah which

---

43 Abu Abdillah, Argumen Ahlussunnah Waljama’ah Jawaban Tuntas Terhadap Tudingan Bid’ah Dan Sesat (Ciputat: Ta’awun, 2011), h. 277.
46 hadith text:

"Who makes this new thing in our religion which is not following it then it is rejected."

"Abu Ja’far Muhammad ibn al-Shabbah and 'Abdullah ibn 'Awîn al-Hilali told us all from Ibrahim ibn sa’d Ibn al-Shabbah said: Ibrahim ibn Saad ibn Ibrahim ibn 'Abdurrahman ibn 'Awîf told us, my father told us from al-Qasim ibn Muhammad from ‘Aisyah he said, Rasulullah SAW said: ”Who makes this new thing in our religion, which is not following it, then it is rejected.” Al-Imâm Abû al-Husain Muhammad ibn al-Hajjâj al-Naisâbûrî, Shahîîh Muslim, Muhaqqiq Muhammad Fu’âd ’Abdul Bâqî, Juz I, II, III Dan IV (Kairo: Mushthafâ al-Bâbî al-Halabi, 1955), 1718 th Hadith, p. 1343.
47 Abdillah, Argumen Ahlussunnah Waljama’ah Jawaban Tuntas Terhadap Tudingan Bid’ah Dan Sesat., h. 279.
commendable) or ghayr madzmûmah (the heresy that is not reprehensible). Therefore, in traditional Islam, not all matters are new or heresy. In the hadith, the general editorial is used, "every bid’ah is heretical," but the word kullu does not always mean everything. The editorial "every bid'ah goes astray" is an expression that shows that generally, heresy is heresy; not all new things are bid’ah; or all heresy is heresy. Those that fall into the heretical category are those that contradict the quran, sunnah, consensus and atsar. At the same time, those that do not violate the Qur'an, sunnah, ijma’, and atsar are categorized as bid’ah hasanah.

Another hadith regarding bid’ah is "Amma ba’du the best words are the book of Allah, the best guidance is the guidance of Muhammad, and the worst case is something new (invented in religion) and every bid ‘ah is misguided"; 48 and "I instruct you to fear Allah, listen to obey, even though you are under the orders of an enslaved person from Habasyi. Because people who live among you after me will see many differences, therefore, you should follow my sunnah and the Khulafaurrayin sunnah, which Allah guided. Hold on to it and bite him with your fangs. Be careful because every new thing is heresy, and every heresy is misguidance". 49 Based on this hadith, Salafi-Wahabi Islam and traditional Islam condemn heresy. It is just that both of them differ in understanding this hadith.

The Salafi-Wahhabi Islamic group understands the editorial "every new thing is a heresy and every heresy is a heresy" in general and absolutely. It seems that the word kullu in the editorial kullu bid’atin “كل بدعه” is understood by Salafi-Wahhabi Islam to include all new things without exception. Therefore, Salafi-Wahhabi Islam rejects the heretical category of Hashanah. This is different from the traditional understanding of Islam, which understands the word kullu in the sense of "some or

---

48 hadith text:

َأَم ۚ أَما بَعْدَ، فَإِنَّ خَيْرَ الْحَدِيثِ كِتَابُ اللهِ، وَخَيْرَ الْهُدَى هُدَى مَُُمَّدٍ، وَشَرُّ الْمُورِ مُُْدَثََتَُُا، وَكُلُّ بِدْعَةٍ ضَلََلَة.*

al-Naisabûrî, Shahîh Muslim, Muhaqqiq Muhammad Fu’âd ‘Abdul Bâqî, Juz I, II, III Dan IV, Hadith to-867, h. 592.

49 hadith text:

{"start_line":"آوِسَيْكُمْ بِبَقِّيَتَيْهَا الْالَّهَ وَالسُّمَّاعَ وَالظَّاهِرَ، وَإِنَّ عِنْدَيْكُمْ خُطِيبًا، فِیَّالَئِنَّا خَبِيثًا، فِیَّالَئِنَّا مَنْ يَعِشْ مِنْكُمْ بَعْدِي فَسَ أُوصِيكُمْ بِتَقْوَى اللَّهِ وَالسَّمْعِ وَالطَّاعَةِ، وَإِنَّ عِنْدَيْكُمْ وَحْشَاءٌ، فَإِنَّ كُلَّ مُُْدَثَةٍ بِدْعَةٍ جِذِ، وَإِبْنَاءِ المُهَدِي، وَفَيْضَاءُهُ، وَفِیَّالَئِنَّا خَبِيثًا، وَفَيْضَاءُهُ صَلَاطَةً، وَفَيْضَاءُهُ، وَفَيْضَاءُهُ صَلَاطَةً، وَفَيْضَاءُهُ صَلَاطَةً، وَفَيْضَاءُهُ صَلَاطَةً.

Traditional Islamic Religious Practice Arguments: Criticism of The Concept of Bid’ah of Islam Salafi-Wahabi

not all”. Therefore, not all bid’ah are misguided, because there are also good bid’ah (hasanah). This opinion is based on the argument that in manthiq theory, the word kullu can mean all or every (li al-jâmi’); and it can also mean some groups or not all (li al-majmû’). For example the sentence kullu nafsin (كُلُّ نَفْسٍ) in the letter Âlî 'Imrân verse 185, which means all or every (li al-jâmi’). Therefore, all living things must die, without exception, including the Angel Azrael; the soul taker also feels death. However, in other verses, the word kullu means "some or not all," such as the sentence kullu sya’in in surah al-Ahqâf verse 25. The sentence kullu sya’in (كُلُّ شَيْءٍ) in this verse cannot be interpreted as "all ". Because what Allah destroyed was only the disbelievers from the nation of 'Ad and their property. Their residence was not destroyed (illa masâkinahum allatî kânû yaskunûnahâ).

Surat al-Anbiyâ’ verse 30 also uses the sentence kulla sya’in (كُلُّ شَيْءٍ), which means "some or not all." According to this verse, everything (whether in the sense of all or every) living God was created from water. Was everything or everything created from water? Surat al-Rahmân verse 15 answers that the jinn was created from flames of fire: "وُخۡلَقُواۡ مِن نَارٍ "("And He created the jinn from flames of fire"). "As for the ark, it belonged to poor people who worked in the sea, and I aimed to destroy it, because before them there was a king who seized every ark"). Was it all or every boat (كُلُّ سَفِينَةٍ) as the text says? Certainly not! The plunder is usually a good boat. To prevent the boat from being seized, it was perforated or damaged. Because of this, traditional Islamic groups understand the word kullu in the sentence kullu bid’atin not in the sense of "all", but in the sense of "some".

On the basis of this argument, Imam al-Nawawî (d. 676 H) stated that the words of the Prophet SAW: "Kullu bid’atin dhalâlatin" are general but specific statements. That most bid’ah are misguided. That means there is a heresy that is not astray. On that basis, the Alussunnah walja’ah scholars divided bid’ah into several categories. Imam al-Syâfi’î (d. 204 H) –for example, divides into misguided and

50 Syekh Ahmad al-Damanhuri, Îdhâh Al-Mubham Min Ma’ânî al-Sullam (Jakarta: Dâr al-Kutub al-Islâmiyyah, 1432), h. 58.
52 Verse text: "مِنَ الْماءِ كُلَّ شَيْءٍ حَيٍ  أَفَلَ يُؤْمِنُونَ وَجَعَلْنا ("And from water We made every living thing. So why don’t they also believe?")

https://doi.org/10.30603/au.v23i1.3498
blameless categories. Bid’ah heresy is a matter that is contrary to the quran, sunnah, atsar and ijma’. While heresy is not reprehensible (ghayr madzmûmah) is a matter that does not conflict with the quran, sunnah, atsar and ijma’. The same division was put forward by Imam Ibn Atsîr al-Jazarî (d. 606 H). Cases that follow religious instructions that do not conflict with the commands of Allah and the Messenger of Allah are categorized as bid’ah hudâ. At the same time, the case that is contrary to both is disgraceful and rejected bid’ah. While matters that are under the auspices of the generality of Allah’s commandments and are things that Allah and His Messenger recommend, they are considered commendable bid’ah.

According to Abu Abdillah, the category of bid’ah Hashanah is indicated by many arguments in both the Quran and hadith. Among the arguments of the Quran is the letter al-Hadid verse 27: "Then We escorted Our messengers behind them and We accompanied (also) Jesus the son of Maryam, and We gave him the Gospel and We placed in the hearts of those who followed him kindness and compassion. Moreover, they invent rahbaniyyah even though We do not oblige it to them but (they themselves invent it) to seek Allah’s pleasure. They do not maintain it with proper maintenance. So We gave the believers among them their reward, and many of them were wicked." This verse contains Allah’s praise for the followers of Prophet Isa who committed bid’ah rahbâniyyah, while this is not obligatory. Rahbâniyyah is an attitude of abstaining from lust by not getting married to get closer to Allah.

While the arguments for hadith include: "Whomever pioneers in Islam (a good habit (sunnah hasanah) [إِنْ سَنْ فِي الإِسْلَامِ سُنَّةٌ حَسَنَةٌ], then he will get the reward of that good habit) and the reward of those who do it after him without reducing their reward in the slightest. Conversely, whoever pioneers Islam a bad habit (sunnah sayyiah), then he will accept the sin of that bad habit and the sins of those who do it after him without reducing their sins in the slightest" and "Who makes this new

---

53 al-Nawawî, Tahdzîb Al-Asmâ’ Wa al-Lughah, Juz III, h. 23.
54 Atsîr, Al-Nihâyah Fi Qarîb al-Hadîts Wa al-Âtsâr, Juz I, h. 267.
55 Hadith text: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: من سَنَنَ فِي الإِسْلَامِ سُنَّةٌ حَسَنَةٌ، فَلَهُ أَجْرُهَا، وَأَجْرُ مَنْ عَمِلَ بَِا بَعْدِهِ، مِنْ غَيِّ ذِي أَنْ يَنْفَقَ مِنْ أَجْرِهِ شَيْئًا، وَمَنْ سَنَنَ فِي الإِسْلَامِ سُنَّةٌ سَلَِّيْهَا، فَلَهُ وَزْرُهَا وِزْرُ مَنْ عَمِلَ بَِا بَعْدِهِ، مِنْ غَيِّ ذِي أَنْ يَنْفَقَ مِنْ أَوْزَارِهِمْ شَيْئًا، كَانَ عَلَّاهُ إِذَا وَزَرَّ مِنْ غَيِّ ذِي أَنْ يَنْفَقَ مِنْ أَوْزَارِهِمْ شَيْئًا.

al-Naisîbûrî, Shahîh Muslim, Muhaqqiq Muhammad Fu’âd ’Abdul Bâqi, Juz I, II, III Dan IV, Hadith to-1017, h. 468-469.
thing in our religion, which is not following it, is rejected".56 The word "سَنَةً" (sanna) in the editorial "من سنة في الإسلام سنة صمصة" in the first hadith is defined as "starting a new matter". This is different from the terms reviving the sunnah (ihyâ’ al-sunnah) or adhering to the sunnah (al-tamassuk bi al-sunnah). The last two terms refer to something which has existed. At the same time, the term sanna in the hadith above refers to new matters.

Meanwhile, the second hadith suggests two forms of new cases. First, which is not included in religion because it violates the rules and arguments of syara', so it is classified as bid’ah Hashanah. Second, bid’ah follows the rules or propositions to be a valid and accepted case, called bid’ah Hashanah.57

In addition to referring to the Quran and hadith, Traditional Islam strengthens the heresy hadith argument with historical evidence of the innovations of the companions during the time of the Prophet's life. Among them are reading prayers after bowing,58 ijtihad prayer reading,59 additional reading of

56 Hadith text:

خَلَّا تَنِي أُبُو حَجَّرْ نَ هَذِهِ السَّلَاحَة، وَقَالَ الْحَامِدُ بْنُ عَوْفَ، قَالَ: أَقْرَأْتَهُ الْحَامِدُ بْنُ عَوْفَ، قَالَ: ثُمَّ أَلَا يَتَعَفَّنِي إِلَى الرَّحْمَةِ بِنِعْمَةِ اللَّهِ عَلَيْهَا.

Ibid., Hadith to-1718, h. 1343.

57 Abdillah, Argumen Ahsussunnah Waljama'ah Jawaban Tuntas Terhadap Tudingan Bid'ah Dan Sesat, h. 280-283.

58 hadith text:

خَلَّا عَنْ بَنِي إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنَ الصَّبَّاحِ، قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ مَُُمَّدُ بْنُ الصَّبَّاحِ، وَعَنْ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ عَوْفٍ، وَعَنْ عِيْضَةَ بْنِ مَلْكٍ عَنْ إِبْرَاهِيمَ بْنِ عَوْفٍ، قَالَ: ثُمَّ أَلَا يَتَعَفَّنِي إِلَى الرَّحْمَةِ بِنِعْمَةِ اللَّهِ عَلَيْهَا.

56 Thabit, Shahîh Al-Bukhârî, Juz I Dan II (Mesir: Al-Kubrâ al-Ámiriyyah, 1311.), h. 159.

59 Hadith text:

"Abdul â h ibn Maslamah narrated to us from Mâlik from Nu'a'im ibn 'Abdul â h al-Mîmir from 'Alî ibn Ya hâ ibn Khallâd al-Zurâq and from Rifâ'î ibn R â fl 'al-Zurqâ I he said: one day we were praying behind the Prophet when he raised his head from bowing, he read: sami'all â hu liman h omidahu, "a man answered behind him: "Rabban â wa laka al- h amdu hamdan kats i ran thayyiban mub ârakan f ì hi. "After he turned away (from greeting), he asked: "Who said the sentence earlier? The man replied: "I am." He said: "I saw more than thirty angels hurrying, I do not know which one wrote it first." Abû Abdillâh Muhammad ibn Ismâ'll Ibrâhîm al-Imâm al-Bukhârî, Shahîh Al-Bukhârî, Juz I Dan II (Mesir: Al-Kubrâ al-Ámiriyyah, 1311.), h. 159.
These four deeds of the Prophet's companions were carried out while the Prophet was alive; what act of worship? While these actions were never taught and practiced by the Prophet. Prophet Saw. New deeds are not criticized and call it bid'ah. Instead appreciated by the Prophet. If the actions of a friend the Prophet never taught, practiced, and exemplified were iconoclastic heresy, the Prophet would have prohibited them. The four innovations of the Prophet's companions in
deepest breath, and then I said the sentence earlier." Then he said: "Indeed, I saw twelve angels scrambling to read that sentence (to Allah's presence), I do not know which one of them picked it up." al-Naisâbûrî, Shahîh Muslim, Muhaqqiq Muhammad Fu'âd 'Abdul Bâqî, Juz I, II, III Dan IV., Hadith to-600, h. 419.

"Qutaibah told us, he said Rif 'â'ah ibn Ya h yâ ibn 'Abdull â h ibn Rif 'â'ah ibn R â f' al-Zurâq i from his father's uncle Mu' â dz ibn Rif 'â'ah from his father, he said: I prayed behind the Messenger of Allah and sneezed, then I said: "rabban â wa laka al- ham amdu hamdan kats i ran thyayiban mub â rakan f i hi, mub â rakan 'alayhi kam â yu h ibbu rabbin â wa yardh â." After he turned away (from the greeting), he asked: "Who said the prayer earlier in the prayer? Nobody answered until he asked the third time. Then Rif 'â'ah ibn Râ f' 'ibn 'Afr â replied: "I am, O Messenger of Allah." He said: "How to try to repeat the sentence." Then I said: "Rabban â wa laka al- ham amdu hamdan kats i ran thyayiban mub â rakan f i hi, mub â kan 'alayhi kam â yu h ibbu rabbin â wa yardh â." Then he said: "By the One Whom I am in His power, indeed that more than thirty angels seized prayer/phrase, I do not know which one of them brought it up." Al-Imâm al-Hâfîz Abî 'Isâ Muhammad Sawrah ibn Mûsâ al-Turmdîzî, Sunan Al-Turmdudzî, Juz II (Mesir: Mushthafâ al-Bâbi al-Halabî, 1975.), Hadith to-404.

"From 'Ali, he said: Abu Bakr recited the Quran in a low voice. 'Umar asked the Quran aloud. While 'Ammar, when reading the Quran, mixes this letter with that letter. Then this was reported to the Prophet. He asked Abu Bakr: "why do you read the Quran in a low voice?" Abu Bakr replied: "Allah can hear my voice even in a low voice." Then the Prophet asked 'Umar: "why do you read the Quran aloud?" 'Umar replied: "I drive out demons and eliminate sleepiness." Then the Prophet asked 'Ammar: "why do you read the Quran mixing this letter with that letter?". 'Ammar replied: "Have you ever heard of me mixing it with something that is not the Quran?" He replied: "No! All good", HR Ahmad, the trusted nurse. Abû al-Hasan Nuruddîn 'Ali ibn Abî Bakar ibn Sulaimân al-Haytsâmî, Majma' al-Zawâid Wa Manba' al-Fawâid, Pentahqîq Hissâmuddîn al-Qudî, Juz II (Kairo: Maktabah al-Qudî, 1414.), Hadith to-3955, h. 265-266.

**Al-Ulum** ISSN 1412-0534, E ISSN 2442-8213
this aspect of worship were used by traditional Islamic writers as historical arguments that not every action that was not ordered and exemplified by the Prophet was bid’ah. After the Prophet died, the innovation of the Companions in the field of worship continued. Among them are additional readings of tashhud in prayers performed by Ibn Mas’ûd (w. 652 M); the third call to prayer on Friday by ‘Uthmân ibn ‘Affân (d. 35 H); Taraweeh prayers under the leadership of an imam initiated by ‘Umar ibn al-Khattâb (d. 23 H).


63 Hadith text:

“From al-Sya’î b î he said: 'Abdul’â bîn Ma’sî bî d after reading the sentence: “Assal â mu ‘alaika ayyuhannâhiyyu wa ra hâ matull â hi wa bar â katuah” read the sentence: “Assal â mu ‘alyâa min Rabbîn â.” Al-Thabrânî narrates hadith i, and the narrator is sha hî hî al-Hâytasî, Majma’ al-Zawwîd Wa Manba’ al-Fawwâîd, Pentahqîq Hissâmuddîn al-Qudsî, Juz II. Hadith to-2863, h. 143.

64 Hadith text:

“Abû Na’aim told us, he said ‘Abdul’azîz bîn Izmâm al-Mâ just âu n told us from al-Alzhrî from al-Sâb ibn Yázî bî d that: ‘Uthmân who added the third call to prayer on Friday when there were many residents of Medina, while the Prophet saw did not have a muezzin other than a muezzin and at that time the Friday call to prayer was echoed while the Imam was sitting on the pulpit” al-Bukhârî, Shahîh Al-Bukhârî, Juz I Dan II. Hadith to-913, h. 8.

65 Hadith text:

وَعَنِ الشَّيْخِ قَالَ: كَانَ عَنَّا مَسْتَفْعَوَ يُقُولُ بُقْيَلُ "السَّلَامُ عَلَيْكَ أَيُّهَا النَّبِيُّ، وَرَحَمَةُ اللَّهِ عَلَيْهِ وَبَرَكَاتُهُ"، الْسَلَّامُ حَبَّانِيَّةٌ مِّنْ تَزَاوُةِ الطَّيْرِيَّةِ فِي الْكَيْبِ، وَرَجَأَ جَالِلُ الْمَصْحُ."
As for the bid’ah carried out by the tâbi’u tâbi’u tâbi’în generation (followers of tabi’în), they included the two cycles of prayer by Imâm al-Bukhârî (d. 870 AD) before placing a hadith in his book Shahîh al-Bukhârî; 800 cycles of prayer every day by Imam Malik (d. 179 H); 1000 cycles of prayer every night by Imam Zainal ‘Âbidîn (d. 713 AD); 1000 cycles of daily prayer by Mush’ab ibn Thabit; the daily prayer of 1000 cycles by Mâlik ibn Dinâr (d. 748 AD); 300 cycles of daily and night prayers by Ahmad ibn Hanbal (d. 241 H); and circumcision prayers before being sentenced to death.66

The three generations above (friends, tâbi’u, and tâbi’u tâbi’în) are called the salaf generation. What they did, was something new; this case was never exemplified and ordered by the Prophet. If you use the criteria of bid’ah in general and absolutely as per the perspective of Salafi-Wahhabi Islam, their actions fall into the category of iconoclastic heresy. This is different from the concept of bid’ah from the traditional Islamic perspective, which emphasizes that not all new things are bid’ah and not all bid’ah are misguidance. Those who fall into the category of heresy if they conflict with the Quran, sunnah and atsar. Those that are not contradictory are categorized as bid’ah Hashanah/mahmûdah.

The actions of the three generations above (which are often called the generation of the Salaf) are a criticism of the concept of heresy in Salafi-Wahhabi Islam which understands bid’ah as an act that was never exemplified and practiced by the Prophet Muhammad. Meanwhile, in a traditional Islamic perspective, the benchmark for bid’ah is not whether there is an example or practice by the Prophet. The benchmark is whether there is a proposition, either implicitly or explicitly. The propositions in question can be in the form of the Quran, hadith, ijma’ and qiyas.

66Khozin, Keruntuhan Teori Bid’ah, h. 78-82.
D. Conclusion

The difference in the perspective of the concept of bid’ah between traditional Islam and Salafi-Wahhabi Islam has implications for the decision of a rite and practice of Islamic tradition. Because the rites and practices of traditional Islamic traditions did not exist at the time of the Prophet and the Salaf generation, they are categorized as bid’ah by Salafi-Wahhabi Islam. In contrast to the traditional Islamic point of view which limits bid’ah as a new act that contradicts the Quran, hadith, and atsar. If appropriate, it is categorized as bid’ah hasanah; a category rejected by Salafi-Wahhabi Islam, which understands bid’ah in general and absolutely; that all new deeds in religion that did not exist at the time of the Prophet and the salafushshâlih were heretical. Traditional Islam criticizes this category of heresy because it is ahistorical.

Bibliography


Damanhurî, Syekh Ahmad al-. *İdhâh Al-Mubham Min Ma’ânî al-Sullam*. Jakarta: Dâr al-Kutub al-Islâmiyyah, 1432.


Qaththani, Sa’id bin Ali bin Wahf al-. Awas Bahaya Bid’ah Bid’ah Berkedok Sunnah. Yogyakarta: Makabah al-Hanif, 2010.


Syam, Syamsuar. “TRADISIONALISME ISLAM SUATU KARAKTER DAN POLA PENGEMBANGAN ISLAM DI INDONESIA.” Al-Hikmah: Jurnal Dakwah dan Ilmu Komunikasi, no. 0 (June 1, 2018): 20–30. doi:10.15548/al-hikmah.v0i0.90.

https://doi.org/10.30603/au.v23i1.3498


