

Volume 19 Number 2 December 2019.p. 334-359 <a href="https://doi.org/10.30603/au.v19i2.967">https://doi.org/10.30603/au.v19i2.967</a>

# The Policy Implementation of Religious Education Teacher Requirement At Public Schools in Samarinda City East Kalimantan Province

#### Mujizatullah

The Religious Research and Development Center of Makassar

#### **Abstract**

This article explained the policy implementation of religious education teachers' requirement at public schools in Samarinda city East Kalimantan Province. Religious education teacher (henceforth called (PAI teacher) is a term refers to a teacher who teach religion course at schools, since Indonesia government put religion as one of course in curriculum. This is qualitative descriptive method. The result showed that the communication among the Education Affair Ministry (henceforth called KEMENAG) and the Religious Affair Ministry (henceforth called KEMINDIKBUD) in Samarinda city East Kalimantan Province are not harmony. They did not find agreement about the structure and the draft of religion teacher requirement. The different understanding among the institutions resulted ego centralism in each of the Ministry. KEMENAG which has vertical line system controlled Islamic schools and the KEMINDIKBUD controlled public schools should build strong coordination to require religion teacher. They should make Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) about the requirement of religion teacher, either as they are government official or outsourcing official.

# Implementasi Kebijakan Pengadaan Guru Pendidikan Agama Pada Sekolah di Kota Samarinda Provinsi Kalimantan Timur

#### **Abstrak**

Artikel ini menjelaskan Implementasi Kebijakan Pengadaan Guru Pendidikan Agama Pada Sekolah di Kota Samarinda Provinsi Kalimantan Timur. Penelitian ini deskriptif kualitatif. Hasil penelitian terdapat komunikasi yang tidak baik antara Dinas Pendidikan dan Kementerian Agama kaitannya dengan penyusunan dan pengusulan formasi dan penetapan pengadaan guru agama PNS. Adanya pemahaman yang berbeda di masing-masing instansi. muncul pemahaman ego sektoral diantara masing-masing kementerian. Kementerian Agama sebagai instansi vertikal yang membidangi madrasah dan Dinas Pendidikan membidangi sekolah bersinergi dalam pengadaan guru agama, diperlukan MOU antara Pemda dengan Kementerian Agama terkait formasi pengangkatan guru agama baik CPNS maupun mengangkat guru agama THL (Tenaga Harian Lepas).

**Kata Kunci:** Samarinda Implementation; Policy, Requirement, Religious education teacher, East Kalimantan Province

Author correspondence

Email: mujizatullah28@gmail.com

\_Available online at http://journal.iaingorontalo.ac.id/index.php/au/index

#### A. Introduction

The course of religion education at school in Indonesia has function to figure out Indonesian who believe and piety to God (Allah SWT) at once has good behavior and able to keep solidarity and tolerance in the plurality of society. It aims to develop the students' ability to understand, to analyze, and to apply the religious value and combine with their knowledge of science, technology, and art. Every level of education such as schools, colleges, and institutions has to include religion course in their curriculum. KEMENAG controls the management system of religion course at Islamic school. Religion course at public school, academic, and university level are arranged in course as the curriculum stated.

The government legislation Number 20 in 2003 about the system of national education, chapter 12, verse (1) letter a, instructed: "Every student is in level of education has right to learn religion course according to their own religion. The religion course is taught by the religion teacher, either at public school or at private school. Once every student has right to learn religion course, the government should prepare and require religion teacher <sup>2</sup>.

Teacher has important role in determining the quality achievement of education. He/she has responsible to teach, to educate, to guide, to direct, to train, and to evaluate the students whatever their level. Indeed, the more qualified the teacher, the more qualified the education, and the worse the teacher quality the worse is the education quality.

As the professional academic, the teacher is required to improve the students' ability and to establish national education system and at once to maintain the aim of national education system. The indicator bases on the improvement of students' competence to be the individual who has piety to God, good character, good health, good competence, and creative.

PAI teacher is a professional academic who has main task to educate, to teach, to guide, to direct, to train, to be role model, and to evaluate the students <sup>3</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "PP\_55\_2007-Pendidikan-Agama-Keagamaan.Pdf," accessed July 13, 2019, https://kelembagaan.ristekdikti.go.id/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/PP\_55\_2007-Pendidikan-Agama-Keagamaan.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "UU\_no\_20\_th\_2003.Pdf," accessed July 13, 2019, https://kelembagaan.ristekdikti.go.id/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/UU\_no\_20\_th\_2003.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> "Pma 15 18.Pdf," July 13, 2019, http://simpuh.kemenag.go.id/regulasi/pma\_15\_18.pdf.

The requirement of PAI teachers who teach religion course at school is urgently need, because their quantity becomes decrease over the time. The government should put serious attention to this case, mainly the regional government (henceforth called PEMDA). To fulfill the need of PAI teachers, the schools usually require the teacher by their own recommendation and finance. PEMDA is only given salary for the one is listed on the letter of acceptance signed by the regency leader (Regent or Governor), because the requirement of PAI teachers at school was done by PEMDA <sup>4</sup>.

The government policy referred to the regulation arranged by KEMENAG, namely the government legislation Number 55 in 2007 which concerned to religion course and explained more in KEMENAG Decree (henceforth called PMA) Number 16 in 2010 about the management of religion course at school. It was launched to solve the problem of PAI teachers' requirement at public schools, the official Law Number 5 in 2014 concerned to the requirement of government officers as crucial aspect.

However, there were many regulations have been arranged, the policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement still became a problem. As the effect, KEMENAG is still considered that the numbers of PAI teacher were less. There were two essential issues that being constraint of PAI teachers' requirement, i.e, no agreement and lack of coordination between KEMENAG and KEMENDIKBUD. There was an overlap regulation which arranged by both Ministry. (Imam Syafi'i the Director of Islamic Education).

The policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement did not back up the quantity of PAI teachers at school. Many schools in Indonesia were still less of PAI teachers, mainly the schools in regions and districts. The distribution of PAI teachers were also not balance. However, the other aspects related to their academic qualification, because they taught religion course, but not their qualification (The Director of Islamic Education). Hopefully, the law of National Educational system and the law of teacher, either its substance or its implementation can solve the educational problems in Indonesia.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Peraturan Menteri Agama Republik Indonesia," n.d., 19.

The Religious Research and Development Center researched about the policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement. The result showed that there was Decentralization management of PAI teachers. PEMDA also required PAI teachers to fill the necessity of the job application. The other research was done by the Research and Policy center of KEMENDIKBUD. It studied the analysis of policy management of vocational school in improving education quality. There were three problems identified namely incompatibility of teacher qualification and teacher applicators, incompatibility of requirement with the teacher qualification, and teacher mutation was not based on teacher qualification;

Therefore, the research topic was done by the Religion Research and Development Center of of Makassar in 2019 to analysis the policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement at Samarinda City East Kalimantan Province. The gap of this research was the setting, namely in Samarinda City and the sample of research was PA teachers who required by PEMDA of Samarinda city.

There were two problems were tried to be analyzed in this research, first, how was the policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement in relation with government legislation Number 11 2017 article 5 about the drafting of process and the determination of PAI teachers' requirement need at school. The implementation of government legalizations article 56 paragraph 3 about the requirement of civil servant teachers' requirement. The implementation of the Ministry of State Civil Empowerment Decree (henceforth called PermenPan) Number 36 2018 article 2 related to the priority of civil servants' requirement 2018 especially on education sector which were based on: communication, human resource, tendency/support, bureaucrat structure. Second, what were the advantage and the disadvantage of the policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement at school?

The aims of this research were to find the description of the policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement at school in relation with government legislation Number 11 2017 article 5 about the drafting of process and the determination of PAI teahers' requirement need at school. The implementation of government regulations article 56 paragraph 3 about the requirement of civil teacher requirement. The implementation of the Ministry of State Civil

Empowerment regulation Number 36 2018 article 2 related to the priority of civil officer requirement 2018 especially on education sector which were based on: communication, human resource, tendency/support, bureaucrat structure. To know the advantage and the disadvantage of the policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement.

This research used descriptive qualitative approach which tries to explain problem base on data. It focused on how was the implementation of policy requirement of Guru Agama in relation with government regulations Number 11 2017 article 5 about the drafting of process and the determination of guru agama requirement need at school and what were the advantage and the disadvantage of the implementation of policy requirement of Guru Agama at school .

#### B. General description of Research Setting

East Kalimantan Province is one of the second largest cities after Papua. It is divided into 10 regencies, namely Paser Regency with Tanah Grogot as the central city, West Kutai with Sendawar as central city, Kutai Kertanegara Regency with Tenggarong as capital city, East Kutai Regency with Sengatta as the capital city, Berau Regency with Tanjung Redeb as central city, North Paser Penajam with Penajam as central city, Balikpapan city with Balikpapan as capital city, Samarinda city with Samarinda as capital city, Bontang Regency with Bontang as central city, and Mahakam Ulu with Long Bagun as central city.

# C. The real condition of Educational was at Samarinda East Kalimantan Province.

The total number of PAI teacher at East Kalimantan in 2018 were 3207 the civil servants were 1889 and non civil servant were 1318 who taught at schools in 8 regencies and two cities. The total number of PAI teacher as civil servants at Kutai Kertanegara is 509, Balikpapan city 227, and Samarinda city 221 and the rest of them taught at schools in 7 regencies. PAI teacher as non civil servants at Kutai Kertanegara in 2018 were 203, Balikpapan city 307, and Samarinda city were 180. The rest of them taught at schools in 7 regencies. From 3207 PAI teacher as civil servants and non civil servants were 1413 men and 1794 women.

The total number of teachers have been certificated in 2018 were 3207; there were 887 civil servants. Teachers have been certificated at Kutai Kertanegara 409, Balikpapan city 87 and Samarinda city. Teachers have not been certificated at Kutai Kertanegara were 100, at Balikpapan city are 140, and Samarinda city are 90 and the rest of them at 7 regencies. The total numbers of non civil servants have been certificated were 145 and not certificated were 1173. In Kutai Kertanegara, there were 31 teachers have been certificated, in Balikpapan city 32, and Samarinda city were 8, the rest of them at 7 regencies. Non civil servants who not certificated were 1173, at Kutai Kertanegara 172, Balikpapan city 275, and Samarinda city 172, the rest of them are at 7 regencies.

The numbers of PAI Teacher based on their teaching places in 2018 were 3073, at kindergarten level 1979, Elementary school 667 teachers, Primary School 253 teachers, and Senior High School 174 teachers. The number of PAI teacher who taught at Kutai Kertanegara Primary School were 48 teachers, Balikpapan city were 40 teachers, and Samarinda city were 39 teachers. The number of PAI Teacher taught at senior high school in Kutai Kertanegera were 29 teachers, Balikpapan city were 37 teachers, and Samarinda city were 34 teachers, the rest of them taught at primary and senior high school level in 7 regencies in East Kalimantan Province.

The total numbers of Christian Religious Education Teachers according to their assignments in 2018 were 803 consisting of 6 Kindergarten Teachers, 449 Elementary Schools, 205 Junior High Schools and 143 High Schools spread across 10 districts / cities in East Kalimantan Province. The number of Christian Religious Education Teachers in Kutai Kertanegara Middle School was 23 teachers, Balikpapan City was 24, and Samarinda City was 26. The number of Christian Religious Education Teachers on duty at Kutai Kertanegara High School was 22, Balikpapan City was 15, and Samarinda City was 29. The rest were distributed in 7 (seven) districts / cities respectively in junior and senior high schools in East Kalimantan Province.

The total number of Catholic Religious Education Teachers by their place of assignment in 2018 was 352 consisting of 202 elementary school teachers, 75 junior high school students, 62 senior high school students and 13 vocational

school students spread across 10 (ten) districts / cities in East Kalimantan Province. The number of Catholic Religious Education Teachers who have served in Kutai Kertanegara Middle School 4 teachers, Balikpapan City 11, and Samarinda City was 14. The number of Catholic Religious Education Teachers who have served in Kutai Kertanegara High School is 12 teachers, Balikpapan City was 4, and Samarinda City was 15. The rest were spread out in each middle and high school in 7 districts / cities in East Kalimantan Province.

The total number of Hindu Religious Education Teachers by their place of duty in 2018 was 20 teachers, consisting of 15 elementary school teachers, three junior high schools, and two senior high schools spread across 7 (seven) districts / cities in East Kalimantan Province. There were no numbers of Hindu Religious Education teachers on the Kutai Kertanegara Middle and High Schools. In Balikpapan City there was no junior high schools for 1 teacher and senior high schools 1 teacher, Samarinda City was not available for junior high schools and senior high schools. The remaining 18 people are spread in elementary, middle and high schools in 4 (four) districts / cities in East Kalimantan Province.

The total number of Buddhist Education Teachers according to their assignment in 2018 was 27 people consisting of 13 elementary schools, 7 junior high schools and 7 senior high schools spread across 6 (six) districts / cities in East Kalimantan Province. There are no number of Buddhist education teachers in Kutai Kertanegara Middle School both in junior high and senior high school, Balikpapan City was four teachers, and 3 were in Samarinda. The remaining 16 teachers of Buddhist Education are spread in elementary, junior and senior high schools in 3 (three) districts / cities in East Kalimantan Province.

The total number of data from the East Kalimantan Public Education Institute in 2019 for 645 junior high schools consisted of 434 public junior high schools and 211 private junior high schools. 220 high schools, consisting of 137 state high schools and 83 private high schools. The number of state junior high schools in Kutai Kertanegara was 101 schools, Balikpapan City was 23 schools, and Samarinda City was 47 schools. The number of private Junior High School in Kutai Kertanegara 42, Balikpapan City 46, and Samarinda City 41. The number of state high school in Kutai Kertanegara was 31 schools, Balikpapan City was 9, and

Samarinda City was 18. The number of private high school in Kutai Kertanegara was 20 schools, Balikpapan City was 14, and Samarinda City was 22. The number of state and private junior and high schools spread in 3 (three) districts / cities was 414 schools, while the remaining 451 public and private junior and senior high schools were spread in seven districts / cities in East Kalimantan Province.

Policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement in Samarinda City, East Kalimantan Province was analyzed through several components: Communication, Resources, Trends, and Bureaucratic Structure. Each of these variables consists of several indicators.

Communication policy related to the decision, before policy officials in this case KEMENAG, the Department of Education, Bureau of organization (District / City Office, Province) henceforth called BKD, Ministry of Civil Servants (Menpan) implement a decision, communication becomes the main requirement <sup>5</sup>, The policy implementation of PAI teachers' requirement at schools related to the implementation of Government legislation Number 11 2017 article 5, has been implemented in junior high schools managed by PEMDA in Samarinda, while senior high schools managed by PEMDA province. It was based on the Law Number 23, 2014 which regulated authority mandate of PEMDA regency to PEMDA province<sup>6</sup> However, communication has not yet been established between the policy makers of the compilation and proposing the formation of Civil servants requirements and KEMENAG. The communication limited to the needs of PAI teachers' requirement and completeness of administration of PAI teachers' certification in schools<sup>7</sup>.

The compilation of data on teacher needs involved only the Principal and the Office of Education in coordination with the regional secretary in the field of organizational analysis of the positions and sub-formation analysis, then the Regional Personnel Board in the planning and formation sub-sectors conducted

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Thomas R. Dye, *Understanding Public Policy*, 2017, 9–10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Interview with Wahyu Chandra Kusuma, Head of the Functional Section of the First Appointment and Dismissal of High School Teachers / Vocational Schools, July, 18 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Interview with Samudi, Head of Islamic Religious and Religious Education (Pakis) Regional Office of KEMENAG of East Kalimantan Province, July 17, 2019

proposals to the Minister of Civil Servant Empowerment (Menpan) to determine the formation of PAI teachers<sup>8</sup>.

After the data of teachers' requirement (henceforth called DKG) format was subsequently sent to MENDIKBUD office, the teacher and education staff (GTK) section make a DKG recapitulation and mapping of PAI teachers aimed at observing the distribution of PAI teachers in the area. When the teacher mapping was done there was no inter-sectoral communication with the agencies related to the preparation and proposals and which established E formation in this case between MENDIKBUD and KEMENAG, between KEMENAG and regency civil servant institution (BKD) as well as the Minister of Civil Servant Empowerment (Menpan)<sup>9</sup>.

The process of preparing and proposing the needs of PAI teachers is based on occupational analysis (AnJab), DKG format was filled by calculating the number of teaching hours per week multiplied the number of classes per class each week equal to the number of teaching hours each week, divided 24 hours per week with the standard requirements. For example the number of teaching hours per week 3 hours times the number of classes per class, for example class VII is 11, class VIII: 5 class IX 8, equals the number of teaching hours per class every week, class VII 33, class VIII 15, class IX: 24 the same with the number of teaching hours per week for 3 classes: 72 divided 24 hours per week is equal to the standard of PAI teacher needs equal to 3.00. Every teacher who has received certification is required to teach 24 hours per week. Mapping techniques of PAI teachers by conducting coalitions between one school and another school, for example if teachers lack teaching hours, then coalitions with other schools are carried out to fulfill their teaching hours. Analysis of the needs of Christian religious students, for example, is calculated from the number of Christian student groups. The realization in each school does not meet the number of 15 students, thus not every school has a

<sup>9</sup> Interview with Ridwan Syah, Head of Procurement and Formation Subdivision (BKPPD) staff, July 17, 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Interview with Mr. Karmin, staff for the procurement and formation of Regional Personnel Board (BKPPD) Samarinda City staff, 24 July 2019

Christian PAI teacher. In this condition, the religion teacher will teach his hours by coalition or by combining religious study hours in several schools <sup>10</sup>.

Fulfillment of E-formation is one of the considerations of employee expenditure, if employee expenditure is more than 50 percent of the Regency Budget Allocation (APBD), then not getting E-formation is considered to be over staffed, it is recommended to arrange staffing by Menpan and BKN, some consideration can be done, such as for the structuring of PAI teachers by way of evaluating the state of PAI teachers in each institution, by way of redistribution (schools with an excess of PAI teachers being transferred to schools that lack PAI teachers). To anticipate that teachers can teach 24 hours / week, they are given additional tasks such as becoming a guide and counseling teacher (BP), BP teachers are counted 12 hours per week, if there is an excess of teachers, there is a redistribution of excess PAI teachers to transfer them to schools that were lacking 11.

Implementation of Government Legislation Number 11 Year 2017 article five related to the preparation of the process and the determination of the need for the appointment of PAI teachers for junior high schools carried out by districts / cities in Samarinda and high schools by East Kalimantan PEMDA Province, and Menpan in the preparation and proposal to determine the need for appointment of CPNS PAI teachers. It can be seen in the results of the interview as explained earlier. The technique of preparing and proposing PAI teachers begins with the Principal filling out the format and the Education Office making a mapping of PAI teachers in all schools. Before DKG was filled out by the principal, he communicated to KEMENAG school supervisors. The data of teachers should be valid and sourced from KEMENAG.

Implementation of Government Legislation Number 11 2017 article 56 paragraph (3) regarding the implementation of decisions related to the need for the appointment of Civil Servant Teachers. After the preparation and proposal of the formation of PAI teachers, the local government as the policy maker has

11

 $<sup>^{10}</sup>$  Interview with Niken, Head of Samarinda BKPPD Functional Sub Division, 17 July 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Interview with Dwi Nuryanto, Head of the ASN BKD Appointment and Dismissal Subdivision of Kutai Kertanegara Regency, East Kalimantan, July 20, 2019

implemented the CPNS procurement by conducting a selection recruitment of prospective civil servants based on the decision of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 429 of 2018 on August 30, 2018 concerning the Need for Civil Servants in the Samarinda City Environment for Fiscal Year 2018, the Samarinda City Government conducted a selection of CPNS revenue in 2018 Budget Year with the following conditions: General requirements, Special Requirements, Procedure for registration and Selection<sup>12</sup>.

Selection of CPNS Appointment of 2018 Local Government religion teachers with online system, involving CPNS selection committee, but in this case the Ministry of Religion was not involved in the selection committee, which involved the Ministry of PAN-RB at the center, CPNS selection committee involving several agencies: in Governor Province, Regency of Regent, Municipality of Mayor. Provincial BKD Office as the Secretariat of the CPNS Selection National Selection Team. Furthermore, the CPNS Selection is carried out in 3 stages:

1). Administration selection by creating an account at SSCN (National Civil Servant Candidate Selection System) on the BKN website. Since the account has been created the registration card of SCCN will be gotten. The exceptions happen when the applicator got account but he/she did not pass the exams, then his/her account blocked and cannot join the application for at least two years. The other rejection caused by the applicator's university is not listed at Higher Education Institution. The requirements should be fulfilled to join the exam were the photograph size not more than 150K, passed the basic competence selection (SKD) with minimal score 40 percentage. SKD test consisted on personal characteristic test, intelligent test, and national perspective test. Minimal score of SKD were 348. Besides SKD, SKB (the field competence selection) was also been the indicator of applicator passing grade. SKB test covered 60 percentages of religious field competence, 50 percentage curriculum and teaching. The passing grade was counted by adding SKD score and SKB score plus 100 point for applicator who has

 $<sup>^{12}</sup>$  Interview with Niken, Head of Samarinda City BKPPD Functional Sub-Office, 19 July 2019

educator certification. The result of examination announced by PEMDA via BKD institution <sup>13</sup>.

Since PAI teachers declared of passing the exam, they came to BKD office and submitted his/her files to sub-field of mutation promotion. He/she got decree letter as CPNS after his/her files went to process of NIP (Number of Civil Servant Identity) submission. The decree letter was paid 80 percentages. Furthermore, the CPNS instructed to join pre-service training which conducted by BKD in the employee development sub field technical training. After passing the training, the CPNS got decree letter which paid 100 percentages. The decree letter was signed by the Head of staffing officer 14.

Here the example:

Samarinda Mayor Decree Number:823/11/300.04/2019 about the requirement of the candidate of Civil Servant (CPNS) on behalf Kholifah, S.Pd.I. The Mayor of Samarinda, based on the Law Number 5 in 2014 about Civil Servant, Government Legislation Number 7 in 1977 about the Legislation of Civil Servant salary. Government Legislation Number 30 in 2015 concerning to seventeenth amendment to Government Legislation Number 11 1977 concerning Civil Servants Salary Regulations; Government Legislation Number 11 in 2017 concerning Management of Civil Servants. Noting: technical considerations Head of Regional Office eighth Banjarmasin State Personnel Agency Number: AG.26472000118 February 25, 2019. This decision was conveyed to: Head of Regional Office VIII BKN Banjarmasin, Head of the State Treasury Service Office East Kalimantan, Head of Samarinda City Regional Financial and Asset Management Agency, Head of Samarinda Branch Office (PT. Taspen (Persero), Head of BKD East Kalimantan<sup>15</sup>.

Furthermore, the conditions to be a teacher based on the Government Legislation Number 11 in 2017, such as Bachelor degree certification, the lowest

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Interview with Kholifah, PAI teacher at SMP 17 Samarinda City, Appointment of 2018 Pemda formation, 22 July 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Interview with Sofyan Adi Wijaya, Head of Planning and Promotion, Samarinda City BKPPD, 23 July 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Interview with Kholifah, a religion teacher at SMP 17 Samarinda City, Appointment of 2018 Regional Government Formation, 22 July 2019

rank was Penata Muda golongan III a, formation available, have good performance listed in performance draft  $^{16}$ .

Based on the results of interviews with several policy makers in the implementation of Government Regulation Number 11 Year 2017 article 56 paragraph (3) regarding the implementation of decisions related to the need for the appointment of PNS Teachers has been implemented, but in the determination of the decision on the appointment of PNS teachers appointed by the Regional Government, the Ministry of Religion did not obtain carbon copies from the Local Government and the Ministry of Religion were not involved in the National Selection Committee for the recruitment of CPNS PAI teachers.

The implementation of Permenpan Number 36 Year 2018 article 2 related to the priority needs of PNS 2018 has been implemented in the appointment of general teacher needs, but in the appointment of PAI teachers has not been prioritized. This can be seen based on the attachment of the Samarinda Mayor Decree Number: 88.05 / 270 / 33.04 dated January 10, 2018. Implementation of the appointment of Islamic primary / junior high school teachers first CPNS 60 people, accompanied by the placement of 90 PAI teachers proposed by BKD to Menpan RB. Fiscal Year 2019, the proposal to the CPNS RB Menpan 600 people, consisting of general teacher formation 386 people, formation of elementary and junior high school religion teachers as many as 86 people with the distribution of Islamic teachers 80 people, Christian 4 people, Catholic 2 people.

Proposed PAI teacher needs for high school / vocational school in 2019, as many as 103 teachers consisting of 37 Muslims, 8 Buddhists, Hindhu 9 people, 25 Catholics, and 24 Christians from the total number of employee proposals totaling 1200 people. General teachers 638 people <sup>17</sup>.

The implementation of Permenpan Number 36 Year 2018 article 2 related to the priority needs of PNS 2018 has not been implemented in terms of the priority needs of CPNS to appoint PAI teachers. This is based on the results of interviews analyzed that the formation of PAI teacher appointments is only 16,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Interview with Niken, Head of Samarinda City BKPPD Functional Sub-Office, 19 July 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Interview with Yuli Fitrianti, S.Psi. Head of Sub-Department of Planning and Procurement Employees of the Regional Civil Service Agency, July 23, 2019

14% for the high school / vocational quota and for elementary and junior high schools 22, 2%. of the number of formation of general teacher appointments in schools. So it can be said that the formation of the need for the appointment of PAI teachers has not been prioritized due to communication between the Ministry of Religion and the Menpan RB as the policy maker who determines the formation of needs is not well established, besides that when mapping the teacher only redistribution of existing teachers and not prioritized the appointment of teachers new because BKD proposes teachers based on needs analysis by considering the availability of the budget by taking into account the retirement age limit.

Determination of information regarding the submission of data on the appointment of PAI teachers determined by the Menpan RB, then the Menpan RB conveys information through a letter to BKD for the Planning and Information Section regarding the determination of data on the appointment of PAI teachers. Based on the data needs of teachers in schools have been implemented according to the attachment of Samarinda Mayor Decree Number: 88.05 / 270 / 33.04 dated January 10, 2019, Implementation of the appointment of the first CPNS expert religion teacher numbered 60 people, accompanied by the placement of 90 PAI teachers proposed by BKD to Menpan RB <sup>18</sup>.

The process of delivering information about the appointment of PAI teachers. Data information was obtained from the Office of Education by holding a coordination meeting to discuss the priority needs of teachers. One example in 2019 The Department of Education proposed to hire 2000 teachers, including PAI teachers, but it was not approved because it was adjusted to local budget constraints. Based on data on the needs of teachers in schools only 100 teachers including PAI teachers. Of the 100 people the number of teachers proposed is only 11 PAI teachers who are proposed with details of elementary school mapping of 3 people. There are 8 junior high schools, while the number of sub-districts is 18, which is spread by more non-civil servant PAI teachers.

Communication Policy makers have not been consistent in the delivery of information related to the preparation of the needs of PAI teachers appointed by

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Interview with Nurhikmah, Secretary of Samarinda City BKPPD, July 19, 2019

the Regional Government, the Ministry of Religion is only limited to information needs while the preparation, the process of proposing and stipulating is not communicated, this is because each agency has a sectoral ego. The Ministry of Religion is a vertical channel with its territory in charge of madrassas, and the Ministry of Education in the area of the school considers that each ministry has the area as already mentioned, sometimes BKD is inconsistent in the delivery of information by picking up the ball so the Education office is missed.

interruption of communication between the Education Office and the Ministry of Religion, only BKD and Dinas Education. This is due to the existence of sectoral egos in each ministry. Each has an understanding that they have been given authority. The Ministry of Religion with vertical work areas is given the authority to manage madrasa education programs and the Education Office is given the authority to manage public schools<sup>19</sup>.

Consistency, effective policy implementation if the implementation order is consistent and clear. Conversely, if the order of policy implementation is not consistent, it will encourage policy implementers to take very loose actions in implementing policies<sup>20</sup>. In this research, there are inconsistencies in implementing the policies. The Ministry of Religion is only involved in the provision of data on teacher needs. Meanwhile, sometimes the delivery of information on the need for procurement of PAI teachers does not go through the Education Office. BKD Functional Position Sub Division informs directly to the principal to fill out the DKG format. The inconsistency is also caused by the delivery of information on the recruitment of PAI teachers only through the internet. This information was not conveyed through the official announcement board at the Education Office so that people who did not understand IT could not know the information<sup>21</sup>.

Coordination is a powerful mechanism in implementing policies on the appointment of PAI teachers. The better coordination of communication between

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Interview with Asmadi, Head of Teacher Training and Education Personnel Division Head of East Kalimantan Province, July 17, 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Dye, *Understanding Public Policy*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Interview with Rozani Erawadi, SH, M.Sc, Head of the East Kalimantan Governor's Office Organization Bureau, July 22, 2019

the parties involved in the implementation process, the assumption of mistakes will be very small to occur and vice versa<sup>22</sup>. The Ministry of Religion is not involved by the relevant agencies in this case the Regional Government and the MenBank RB so there is no coordination in decision making with agencies related to the preparation and determination of the needs of PAI teachers. The main task is to formulate and propose the needs of employees and to conduct CPNS test (CPNS test committee) along with BKN Regional Offices (Kanreg) and supervised by the central BKN (National Personnel Agency) as the Coordinator of the CPNS selection committee.

The coordination of policy makers in the Ministry of Religion is not involved in cross-sectoral meetings between relevant agencies, in this case the Office of Education, BKD and Menpan RB, so that coordination with policy makers is not established in determining the policy for drafting and proposing the need to appoint PAI teachers<sup>23</sup>.

#### Resource,

Important resources include adequate staff (Implementers) and good skills to carry out their duties, authority and facilities needed to translate the policy to carry out government services. Resources, the most important sources in implementing policies , but the amount of resources does not always have a positive effect on policy implementation. lack of resources will lead to other complex issues regarding effective policy implementation., implementation tends to be inefficient, more on the lack of quality resources and low motivation of the implementers<sup>24</sup>.

Implementing policies on the appointment of PAI teachers namely Menpan RB at the center, in the Province by the Governor, in the Municipality of the Mayor, in the Regency of the Regent, Selection Committee (BKD), Diknas and the School Principal. The selection committee for the appointment of PAI teachers is determined by the BKD by involving staffing elements, related institutions of the

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Riant Nugroho Dwijowijoto, *Kebijakan publik : formulasi, implementasi, dan evaluasi* (Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo, 2003).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Interview with Edi Handaka, principal of Loa Janan 1 High School, July 29, 2019).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Leo Agustino, "Partisipasi Publik Dalam Proses Menuju Indonesia Baru Evaluasi Terhadap Perkembangan Pemerintahan," 2005.

education office with consideration of the availability of the budget, but not all parties who have the authority to implement the policy for the appointment of PAI teachers understand the implementation rules or do not yet have adequate competence. and the proposed formation of the appointment of PAI teachers in schools has not been consistent because there is no information back from the education office to the school after the data needs (formations) have been determined by the Minister of Education. Submission of information on the proposed formation of PAI teacher appointments was only conveyed to the education office, BKD, ortala in the regional Secretariat<sup>25</sup>.

Determination of the functional position credit score for PAI teachers still involves competent Ministry of Religion officials, including the Director General of the Ministry of Religion in charge of Education related to Middle-ranking teachers, coaches for goal IV. Yyyy I gol.ruang room III / d, Head of the Ministry of Religion Ministry for the first rank of Young Stylist teacher gol.ruang room III / a and Young Stylist Tkt. I gol.ruang III / b. <sup>26</sup>.

Information is the second important source in policy implementation. Information has two forms. the first: Information about how to implement a policy, policy implementers need to know what is done and how they should do it. The second form of information is data about the compliance of other personnel with government regulations. Implementers must know whether the personnel involved in implementing the policy can obey the law<sup>27</sup>.

The information conveyed is quite clear through the online website, but the information is not announced through the official notice board manually at the Office of Education and BKD so that it can only be known by certain people who master IT. / 300.04 concerning Selection Acceptance of Candidates for Civil Servants of Samarinda City Government for Fiscal Year 2018, appointment and appointment of functional positions of PAI teachers by the Mayor as the Acting Guidance Officer. Dissemination of Government Regulation No. 55 of 2007 concerning Religious and Religious Education regarding if there are 15 students

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Interview with Yuli Fitrianti, S.Psi. Kasubbid for Planning and Procurement of Regional Personnel Agency Personnel, BKD of East Kalimantan Province, July 23, 2019

Interview with Niken, Head of the BKPPD Functional Sub-Office of Samarinda City, July 19, 2019
Winarno Surakhmad, *Pengantar penelitian ilmiah: dasar, metode dan teknik* (Bandung: Tarsito, 1990).

from one religion in one class in the school then it is obligatory to obtain religious education and be taught by teachers of the same religion who have not been well socialized so that policy implementers do not understand when mapping PAI teachers in every school that results in the distribution of PAI teachers is not evenly distributed in each school<sup>28</sup>.

Facilities are an important resource in implementation. An executor in this case BKD as secretariat of the CPNS selection committee for PAI teachers has adequate staff, understands what needs to be done, and has the authority to carry out their duties. However, coordination is needed for equipment, buildings as offices to coordinate (Winarno, 2012) . Availability of facilities / budget The appointment of PAI teachers is provided through online computerized system registration facilities using the Computer Assisted Test (CAT) application, selection committee, computer operators, exam desks, chairs, consumption and their place in the building. All CPNS selection funds for the formation of PAI teachers are borne by the BKD of the City / Regency / Prov<sup>29</sup>.

Based on the results of the interview above, the executor of the policy has not been consistent in terms of preparation and proposing the needs of PAI teachers, sometimes coordination between related agencies is interrupted due to technical reasons, one example is sometimes the BKD system in terms of preparing the teacher's E-formation directly to the school asking the head schools to fill in the DKG format thus the coordinate to the KEMENDIKBUD Office is missed. Information on the announcement of acceptance of CPNS has not been fully socialized to the East Kalimantan community. There are not enough building facilities available for the CPNS participant selection test.

#### D. Trend

Trends / attitudes of implementers, the tendency of implementing policies is consequently important for effective policy implementation. There needs to be

 $<sup>^{28}</sup>$  Interview with Naship Nashuru S.Pd M.Pd, Principal of 1 Loa Janan Middle School, 19 July 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Interview with Dwi Nuryanto, Head of the ASN BKD Subdivision Appointment and Dismissal of Kutai Kertanegara East Kalimantan, July 18, 2019

support for a policy and thus, they will implement the policy as desired by the initial decision makers 30.

Support or policy filling the formation of PAI teachers to fulfill the position of religion teachers, the availability of budget for the appointment of PAI teachers by policy makers to complement the shortage of civil servant PAI teachers in schools by appointing THL (temporary daily labor) PAI teachers, the term was previously called PTT teachers, in 2007 called T3D (Regional Non-Permanent Workers) and the term THL teacher began in 2010, the process of proposing based on DKG in schools. Schools that need PAI teachers propose to KEMENDIKBUD office. Decree letter issued by the Head of KEMENDIKBUD in Regency, teacher salaries are paid by the APBD through the Department of KEMENDIKBUD, the certification is paid by KEMENAG. Decree issued by BKD and the salary paid by the National Education and Welfare (honorarium) T3D salary from the Regional Government Rp. 1,500,000, in 2010 switched to THL monthly incentives from the Education Office Rp. 1,000,000 are transferred through the account numbers of each PAI teacher. The amount of welfare fee per month was 3,474,300 in Indonesia currency. Certification was paid from the KEMENAG every quarter. However, teacher salaries are often late, sometimes paid once every three months. In addition to teaching obligations, THL PAI teachers were required to submit monthly reports on daily teaching and learning activities to KEMENAG office. The teacher submitted online through the application of monthly reports 31.

The current certification rule is the number of teaching hours of at least 18 hours per week, if this happens the PAI teacher is required to teach extracurricular a maximum of 1 teacher 6 hours per week including teaching extracurricular, such as scout activities two hours per week, spiritualists two hours per week. Religious education and character education according to the 2013 curriculum were required three hours per week<sup>32</sup>.

The flow of disposition of policy making regarding the preparation, the appointment of PAI teachers starts from the disposition of the office of the BKD

Al-Ulum ISSN 1412-0534, E ISSN 2442-8213

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Winarno Surakhmad, Pengantar penelitian ilmiah: dasar, metode dan teknik.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Interview with Nurlia S.Pd, religion teacherTHL Middle School 1 Loa Janan, 19 July 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Interview with Fajar Siaga, Principal of Middle School No. 2 Samarinda, East Kalimantan Province, 22 July 2019

Head of Subdivision of the Functional Position to the Head of Planning and Promotion, then the disposition to the BKD Secretariat then the disposition to the Head of the BKD Office and the disposition to the General Administrative Assistant of the Regional Secretariat of the Organization, and the disposition the latter was continued to the Mayor as the Staffing Officer<sup>33</sup>.

Attitude / behavior and vice versa if the behavior of the implementers is different from the decision maker, the process of implementing a policy becomes more difficult (Winarno, 2012). The impact of the tendency of many policies into the zone of indifference. There are policies that are implemented effectively because they have the support of the implementers of the policies, but other policies will conflict directly with the views of the implementers of the policy or the personal or organizational interests of the implementers.

Personality attitude and commitment, honesty and democratic nature of policy makers and implementers because all stages of the appointment of PAI teachers begin with the registration process, CPNS acceptance selection and CPNS graduation announcement received are carried out transparently and online through the BKD website and in accordance with applicable rules and regulations<sup>34</sup>.

Based on the interview results above, regarding the support of policy makers in terms of teacher welfare has not been well distributed. This often results in late teacher salaries, sometimes salaries are paid every 3 months due to budget constraints resulting in a government discourse that no longer pleases to hire honorary teachers but extend the service period of teachers who have entered retirement according to their maximum needs until they reach 65 years of age.

#### E. Bureaucratic Structure

The bureaucracy is one of the bodies that as a whole implements policies. Bureaucracy for collective agreement in order to resolve government problems in the appointment of teachers and with regard to the suitability of the organization

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Interview with Sofyan Adi Wijaya Head of Planning and Promotion, 23 July 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Interview with Yuli Fitrianti, S.Psi, Head of Sub-Department of Planning and Procurement of Employees of the Regional Civil Service Agency, East Kalimantan Provincial BKD, July 23, 2019

which is the organizer of the implementation of government policy. The implementation of government policies is not effective because of the lack of coordination and cooperation between institutions or the government<sup>35</sup>.

The flow of policy decisions and those interested in making policies for the preparation and proposals for the appointment of PAI teachers starts from the school compiling the DKG (teacher needs data), technical to determine the number of teachers needed and carried out systematically by using job analysis techniques, the decision flow:

Schools compile data on teacher needs and then submit it to the Office of Education; Regency / City Education Office for Junior High School and Provincial Education Office for Senior High School compile ANJAB, ABK and Position Map (teacher equality) documents in the context of appointing civil servant religion teachers; The Education Office submits a letter along with ANJAB, ABK documents and Position Map (teacher distribution) to the Regional Secretary of East Kalimantan Province c.q Head of the East Kalimantan Province Regional Secretariat Bureau; The Head of the East Kalimantan Province Regional Secretariat Bureau sent a letter to the Ministry of Education and Culture's Central Board of Trustees to obtain functional position formation recommendations with attachments to ANJAB, ABK and Position Map documents; Based on the Ministry of Education and Culture's recommendations, the Head of the East Kalimantan Province Regional Secretariat Bureau sends a reply regarding the recommendation for the formation of functional positions to the East Kalimantan Governor / Regional Personnel Management Officer (PPK); East Kalimantan Governor Office of Regional Secretariat Office sent a letter to the Minister of PAN and RB to obtain the determination of functional position formation based on functional position recommendations from the Central Board of Trustees (Kemdikbud); The Minister of PAN and RB sends a reply letter regarding the establishment of functional position formation to the East Kalimantan Governor / Regional Personnel Management Officer (PPK); The Regional Secretariat Office of the Governor's Office through the Provincial BKD appoints proposed civil servants into the Functional

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Dwijowijoto, Kebijakan publik: formulasi, implementasi, dan evaluasi.

Position of Expertise and Skills based on the stipulation letter of Menpan and RB Number B / 528 / M.SM.01.00 / 2018 dated October 15, 2018 concerning Terms of the Appointment of Civil Servants in Functional Position Teacher<sup>36</sup>. For more details, see the table below.

Policy Makers, Those interested in taking policy are the Mayor's Official Development Officer (PPK) in the Municipality, Regents in the Regencies and Governors in the Provinces, taking into account budget availability, civil service retirement age limits and facilities for the appointment of PAI teachers.

The bureaucratic structure has to do with the appointment of PAI teachers. Regional Secretariat Organizational Section: Bupati and Mayor Offices in regencies / cities. The Governor's Office in the Province, the BKD office for Planning and Promotion consists of 3 subfields: 1) Structural Position Subfields, 2) Functional Position Subfields. 3. Employee Planning and Procurement Subfields<sup>37</sup>.

Based on the results of bureaucratic structure interviews regarding the policy decision making flow that the Regional Secretariat Organization Bureau is likened to a house building that makes the house the Organization Bureau and that fills the house is the BKD and which increases the building capacity by carrying out Education and Training activities.

#### F. Supporting and Inhibiting Factors

Supporting factors Communication, related to the decision, the implementation of government regulation No. 11 of 2017 article 5 regarding the preparation of the process and the determination of the need for the appointment of PAI teachers has been implemented at the district / city level for junior high school and provincial level for senior high school.

Implementation of government regulation article 56 paragraph (3) regarding the implementation of decisions related to the need for the appointment of PNS teachers. has implemented the CPNS procurement by selecting the recruitment of prospective civil servants based on the decision of the Minister of

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Interview with Nurdin, Kasubag Analysis and formation of the position of the Institutional Section and Anjab Organization Bureau of the Regional Secretariat of the Governor's Office of East Kalimantan Province, 22 July 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Interview with Sofyan Adi Wijaya, Head of Planning and Promotion, July 23, 2019

Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 429 2018 on August 30, 2018 concerning the Needs of Civil Servants in the City of Samarinda in 2018 Budget Year,

Certification of religion and education teachers is linear with the formations available. Complete list of Teacher Data needs from the education office complete with dapodik application. Resource; The Ministry of Religion was involved in the determination of PAK starting from the Directorate General of Ministry of Religion, the Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religion and the Head of the Regency / City Ministry of Religion. Availability of supporting facilities from BKD for CPNS selection.

Trend; Appointment of Freelance Daily Teachers to cover shortages of PNS teachers.

#### G. Obstacle factor

Communication: good communication was not established between the Ministry of Religion and the Regional Government and Menpan RB in terms of preparing proposals and determining the needs of CPNS PAI teachers. Submission of information about CPNS selection announcements is inconsistent because it is less widely socialized among the public because it is only through online.

The implementation of Permenpan Number 36 Year 2018 article 2 related to the priority needs of the 2018 civil servants has not been implemented, the appointment of PAI teachers has not been prioritized. Coordination, policy makers do not coordinate with the Ministry of Religion regarding the preparation of proposals and determining the needs of PAI teachers.

Resources, the Field of Teachers and Education Personnel at the Education Office have difficulty in obtaining complete data because the Operational Data Educator (Dapodik) operator in the SK is to maintain the confidentiality of the data, only certain people can access the data source. months are sometimes not real with the data reported in the quarterly Dapodikper so DKG is not in accordance with the Dapodik. Honorary teachers who are in category 2 (K2) under 2005 who were appointed as CPNS with the formation of teachers are still many who do not functional requirements of teachers. meet the

Tendency / support, The welfare of PAI teachers who are freelance is still too late to receive their salaries. In S.K, CPNS and PNS PAI teachers do not have the name of the Ministry of Religion as a copy, it is important in the Ministry of Religion to pay for the certification of PAI teachers appointed by the Regional Government.

#### H. Conclusion

Implementation of the policy on the appointment of religious education teachers in schools in relation to Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 article 5 regarding the preparation of the process and determination of the needs for the appointment of PAI teachers in schools. Implementation of Government Regulation article 56 Paragraph (3) concerning the implementation of decisions related to the need for the appointment of PNS teachers. The implementation of Permenpan Number 36 Year 2018 article 2 is related to the priority needs of the 2018 PNS especially in the field of Education, by looking at several variables;

Communication: Communication is not established between the Education Office and the Ministry of Religion in relation to the preparation and proposition of formation (needs), the process and the appointment of PNS PAI teacher appointments, which establish communication and coordination only between the Education Office, BKD, the North Sumatra Provincial Government and the RB Menpan. There is a different understanding in each agency that the Ministry of Religion has a vertical channel in charge of madrasas, and the Education Office is in charge of schools so that sectoral ego understanding arises between each ministry.

Resources: the relationship with policy implementers is inconsistent because there is no information back from the Education Office to the school after the teacher needs (formation) data is determined by the Menpan RB. Submission of information on the proposed formation of PAI teacher appointments is only conveyed to the Office of Education, the Ortala Bureau and Regency / City / Province BKD. Honorary teachers who fall into category 2 (K2) under 2005 who were appointed as CPNS with teacher formation are still many who do not meet the functional requirements of the teacher.

Tendency, Support or policy of filling the formation of PAI teachers to fulfill the position of religion teachers, the availability of budget for the appointment of

PAI teachers by policy makers to complete the shortage of civil servant religion teachers in schools by appointing PAI teachers THL (Freelance Daily Workers), SK issued by the Department of Education Teacher salaries are paid by APBD funds through the Department of Education, the certification is paid by the Ministry of Religion, but teacher welfare is sometimes late in payment. The democratic nature of policy makers and implementers is good because all the process of hiring PAI teachers starts with the registration process, CPNS acceptance selection and CPNS graduation announcements received are carried out transparently online through the website and in accordance with applicable rules and regulations.

Bureaucratic structure, policy decision flow for the appointment of PAI teachers with stages starting from the Department of Education compiling documents determining the need for appointment of PAI teachers based on job analysis and workload analysis and position maps for teacher functional positions. The document was submitted to the Regional Secretariat cq. The head of the Ortala Bureau, then the basis of the letter through the governor's letter sent a letter to the Central Ministry of Education and Culture to obtain recommendations for the formation of functional teacher positions. Based on the recommendation, the governor wrote to the Menpan RB to get the establishment of functional teacher formation. Based on the stipulation of the Menpan RB, the provincial BKD appoints functional teachers.

#### **Bibliography**

- Dwijowijoto, Riant Nugroho. *Kebijakan publik : formulasi, implementasi, dan evaluasi*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo, 2003.
- Dye, Thomas R. *Understanding Public Policy*, 2017.
- Leo Agustino. "Partisipasi Publik Dalam Proses Menuju Indonesia Baru Evaluasi Terhadap Perkembangan Pemerintahan," 2005.
- "PERATURAN MENTERI AGAMA REPUBLIK INDONESIA," n.d., 19.
- "PMA\_15\_18.Pdf." Accessed July 13, 2019. http://simpuh.kemenag.go.id/regulasi/pma\_15\_18.pdf.
- "PP\_55\_2007-Pendidikan-Agama-Keagamaan.Pdf." Accessed July 13, 2019. https://kelembagaan.ristekdikti.go.id/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/PP\_55\_2007-Pendidikan-Agama-Keagamaan.pdf.
- "UU\_no\_20\_th\_2003.Pdf." Accessed July 13, 2019. https://kelembagaan.ristekdikti.go.id/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/UU\_no\_20\_th\_2003.pdf.
- Winarno Surakhmad. *Pengantar penelitian ilmiah : dasar, metode dan teknik.* Bandung: Tarsito, 1990.